

## **PLANS BOARD**

### **Minutes of a meeting of the Plans Board held on Wednesday, 4 November, 2009 at 6.00 p.m. in the Civic Offices, Telford, Shropshire**

**PRESENT:** Councillors I.T.W. Fletcher (Chairman), R.G. Chaplin, N.A. Dugmore, J.A. Francis, G.M. Green, H. Rhodes, C.F. Smith (substitute for Councillor F.R. Picken) and M.J. Smith

**ALSO PRESENT:** Councillor D. Wright for planning application W2009/0618 and Councillor R.E. Groom for planning application W2009/0793

#### **PB-50        MINUTES**

**RESOLVED** - that the minutes of the meeting of the Plans Board held on 15 October, 2009 be confirmed and signed by the Chairman.

#### **PB-51        APOLOGY FOR ABSENCE**

Councillor F.R. Picken

#### **PB-52        DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor C.F. Smith declared a prejudicial interest in planning application W2009/0793 during discussion and determination of which he would leave the room.

Councillor N.A. Dugmore declared a personal but non-prejudicial interest in planning application W2009/0836

#### **PB-53        PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR DETERMINATION**

- (a)    W2007/1382 – Candles Landfill Site, Dog in the Lane, Little Wenlock, Shropshire

This application sought approval of the variation of Conditions 6 & 8 of Planning Permission W92/0903 in order to extend the period of time for the disposal of controlled waste until 31st December 2012 and restoration of the site until 31st December 2013. As set out in the report, this application had been submitted to resolve the outstanding issues in relation to planning application (W2006/1552), which the applicant had withdrawn in July 2007 following an officer recommendation of refusal. A copy of the officer report on application W2006/1552 was appended to this current report, and a copy of the planning permission in respect of W93/903 had been circulated to Members for their further information.

Condition 6 of permission W93/903 required landfilling to be completed within ten years of its commencement and Condition 8 required restoration within 11 years of the date of commencement of tipping, i.e. 14<sup>th</sup> April 1997. Therefore, tipping should have ceased on 13<sup>th</sup> April 2007 and restoration have been

completed by 13<sup>th</sup> April 2008. It was the modification of the expiry dates of these two planning conditions that were proposed in this application.

A further 5 years of tipping would, potentially, allow the present licensed permitted landfill void of some 0.75 million cubic metres to be fully utilised. All other aspects of site operations including hours of operation, environmental controls and restoration of the site to woodland and meadow with 5 years aftercare would remain the same with no proposed modifications. It was further proposed to give the Council the option of leasing the site on completion of aftercare works with a commuted sum of £25,000.

The saved policies of The Shropshire and Telford & Wrekin Joint Structure Plan, 1996-2011 and the Wrekin Local Plan, 1995-2006, the policies of the adopted Regional Spatial Strategy (RSS11) and supplementary national planning guidance were relevant to the determination of this application.

The report detailed the consultation responses. Little Wenlock Parish Council supported the proposed variation of the two conditions but wished to have a circular bridlepath around the site and the Coalmoor Coal Disposal Point Area restored. The Council's Rights Of Way Officer had confirmed that any change to the bridlepath route did not have to be included in the proposals for this application.

The Council's Leisure Facilities & Physical Activity (LFPA) Manager had advised that the authority would like the option to lease the land along with a £25,000 commuted sum. As the LFPA Manager would not wish to see the land split into separate parcels, it was suggested that the preferred option would be for the Council to lease the whole site. The Council could then determine how the land should be used alongside the existing Horsehay Golf Course. The figure of £25,000 was less than that originally requested for community benefits in the local area but, as this figure was not based on any mathematical equation, and given the Company's willingness to lease to the site to the Council, it was considered acceptable.

None of the other Council consultees had submitted any objections to the proposal but objections had been submitted by two local residents, as summarised in the report. The Site Liaison Group had discussed this application and the management of the site in general and was of the overall view that the site was being run adequately and the present application could be supported. There was an acceptance that, notwithstanding the need to recycle more waste, the existing licensed void space should be utilised for tipping licensed wastes. The site would be regularly monitored by the Environment Agency in relation to its Pollution, Prevention and Control Permit, and by the Council for environmental health and planning issues.

Since withdrawal of application W2006/1552, Veolia had agreed a 27 year integrated waste management contract with the, then, Shropshire Waste Partnership, now Shropshire Council. As a result, the proportion of Shropshire's municipal waste needing to be landfilled was now being tipped at the Candles landfill site rather than, as previously, at the Granville landfill site, which was operated by SITA, the previous service provider. As set out in the

report, Telford & Wrekin, for all practical purposes, provided the municipal landfill capacity in the Shropshire and Telford & Wrekin sub-region, a situation that might well continue for a few years.

Veolia had advised that, as at October 2009, there was approximately 0.75 million cubic metres of remaining licensed void capacity at the site. On this basis, it would have to tip at some 230,000 tonnes per annum to complete infilling the remaining licensed void space by the end of 2012. The maximum amount of permitted wastes that were allowed to be imported to the Candles was 435,000 tones per annum. However, whilst importing Shropshire's municipal waste had increased tipping, there had been a reduction in the amount of industrial and commercial wastes imported due to the recession, although this was expected to increase once the current economic climate had improved. This should have the overall effect, notwithstanding initiatives to reduce the amount of landfill, of reducing the operational life of Candles. It was, therefore, considered prudent at this stage not to recommend the granting of planning permission for tipping at the site beyond the end of 2012, although it could not be guaranteed that all licensed tipping capacity would be completely utilised by the end of 2012. In conclusion, as set out in the report, the proposals were compatible with national planning guidance, regional and saved development plan policies.

Councillor C.F. Smith expressed concern at the application given the recent approval of the coal mining application at Huntingdon, which would affect the same area of Telford, and questioned whether this was likely to be the last such application for a variation of the conditions. He wished to see the site closed at the earliest opportunity but accepted that the revised dates, if approved, were reasonable. Other members welcomed the S106 contribution and the utilisation of the remaining landfill capacity on the site.

The Head of Planning & Transport responded that there was no guarantee that the applicant would not submit a further application for a variation in the conditions, but the current variation was the shortest period that could be achieved. At this point in time it was not possible to foresee any future issues, but this variation, if approved, would enable the applicant to satisfactorily finish the site.

**RESOLVED – that with respect to planning application W2007/1382 subject to the applicant entering into a Section 106 Agreement dealing with the option to lease all or part of the Candles landfill site and the payment of £25,000, upon the signing of that lease to delegate authority to the Head of Planning & Transport to grant variation to condition 6 cessation of landfill until 31<sup>st</sup> December 2012 and condition 8 completion of restoration until 31<sup>st</sup> December 2013 of planning permission W93/903.**

(b) W2009/0618 – Land Adjacent to 81 Coronation Crescent, Madeley, Telford, Shropshire

This application for the erection of a single dwelling in the side garden of this property had been deferred by the Board at its meeting on 15 October, 2009 to allow Members to make a Site visit.

Members' attention was drawn to the comments received from the applicant's agent in response to the officer's report, a copy of which was tabled at the meeting. However, despite these comments, officers remained of the opinion that the site was unsuitable for development and, if approved, would constitute an over-development in this area.

Councillor D. Wright, who had requested that the application be determined by the Plans Board, was invited to address the Board. In supporting the application, he said that the applicant and the occupants of no. 52 Coronation Crescent shared an access and could only reverse out onto the highway. However, development of the site and the provision of four parking spaces would enable the occupants of both properties to drive out forwards. With regard to the Highways Engineer's objections on the grounds of increased traffic generation, Councillor Wright said that, following the closure of Madeley Court School, there was now less traffic on Court Street. In conclusion, he agreed that the view from properties on Court Street would be restricted but not to the extent that the Wrekin could no longer be seen.

Councillor G.M. Green, the other Ward Member for Madeley, was of the view that traffic on Court Street had not reduced. She also believed that the proposal, if approved, would make the site look out of keeping with those adjacent and would set a precedent for future applications. This view was supported by other members, who agreed that the development would be an over-development and result in traffic problems given the shared access.

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application W2009/0618 permission be refused on the following grounds:

- 1. The Local Planning Authority considered that the proposed development was unacceptable and was an overdevelopment of the site which failed to respect and respond positively to its context. The addition of a new detached dwelling on the plot would create an incongruous and cramped form of development within the street scene, out of character with the spacious semi-detached built form of Coronation Crescent. Accordingly, the proposal was contrary to 'saved' Policies UD2 and H6 of the Wrekin Local Plan 1995-2006, Policies CS5 and CS15 of the Core Strategy 2007 and national planning guidance in PPS1: Delivering Sustainable Development and PPS3: Housing;**
- 2. The Local Planning Authority considered that the traffic generated by the proposed development was likely to result in an increase in highway danger owing to the intensification in use of a vehicle access location which afforded restricted visibility splays for drivers existing onto the highway. Accordingly, the proposal was contrary to 'saved' Policies UD2 and H6 of the Wrekin Local Plan 1995-2006, Policies CS5 and CS15 of the Core Strategy 2007 and national planning guidance in PPS1: Delivering Sustainable Development and PPS3: Housing.**

(c) W2009/0759 – 1 Ellerdine, Heath Lane, Ellerdine, Shropshire

This application sought planning permission for a large garage of three bays fronting the road and two storage bays to the rear, with ancillary living accommodation above. Following refusal of a similar proposal earlier in the year, the size of the garage had been reduced and slight changes made to the character of the proposal. The previously extended, large detached property was surrounded by garden land and a paddock and sited within the rural area. It was accessed via a driveway to the front that ran to the north of the dwelling. Within the grounds, to the north-east, were large detached outbuildings of a prefabricated construction, which had previously been used with the paddocks as part of a small holding.

Ercall Magna Parish Council had objected to the application on the grounds of the size of the development and its relationship with the main dwelling. No other objections had been received but the Fire Safety Officer had requested the placement of an informative with regards to access

The proposed garaging would replace the existing single storey outbuildings, sited approximately 12m from the extended dwelling. The roof ridge would be 0.3m lower than that of the existing dwelling and 0.7m lower than the dwelling. This lower eaves height would give a more subservient appearance and, therefore, it would not detrimentally dominate the extended property. The proposal had been amended so that the dormer windows at the front matched those of the dwelling with the same roof slope being retained. To ensure that the proposal was not detrimental to the character and appearance of the dwelling or the surrounding area, a condition would be imposed requesting that samples of all the materials to be used were submitted prior to commencement. The land on which the garage was to be located appeared to be at a higher level than the existing dwelling and, to ensure that this did not result in the development dominating the dwelling, a condition would be imposed requesting a plan of the finished levels on the site to be approved prior to commencement.

Given its distance from the existing dwelling, the garage could be separated into a new dwelling, leading to an undesirable separation of the curtilage. To prevent this, a condition would be placed to ensure that the development was only used for purposes incidental to the enjoyment of the existing dwelling and did not become a separate unit of accommodation at some future date. In addition, to prevent the ground floor of the proposed garage becoming additional living accommodation and thus placing additional pressures on the residential curtilage of the dwelling, it would be conditioned to be retained for purposes incidental to the use of the dwelling house, but not to include living accommodation.

As the site was bounded by fields, with the nearest neighbouring properties being approximately 60m away, the proposed development would not be of detriment to the surrounding properties. As the property benefited from large grounds the proposal would leave adequate private amenity space. In conclusion, as the proposal was in keeping with the character and appearance of the general area and would not be detrimental to the amenities

of the neighbouring properties, it complied with policies UD2 of the Wrekin Local Plan and CS15 of the Core Strategy.

The Planning Officer stated that the proposed garage was acceptable as a building, but stressed the importance of ensuring that it was not converted into a dwelling at some future date.

Several members expressed concern at the size of the proposal and the potential for its conversion. However, the Chairman drew their attention to conditions D129 and D127, which control future use. The Head of Planning & Transport added that, whilst these were the strongest conditions that could be imposed, there was no guarantee that a future application would not be submitted seeking permission to convert the garage into living accommodation. It was, therefore, important, that the Council, Parish Council and neighbouring properties should be vigilant in checking that this was not done without benefit of planning permission.

**RESOLVED – that with respect to planning application W2009/0759 planning permission be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.**

(Councillor C.F. Smith, having previously declared an interest in the following application, left the room during discussion and determination thereof.)

(d) W2009/0793 – Wrockwardine Wood & Trench Parish Council Building, Church Road, Wrockwardine Wood, Telford, Shropshire

This application was in respect of the erection of a single storey side extension to the Parish Council building to provide an enlarged parish room and chair store. The building was attached to Wrockwardine Wood Infant School and Nursery, and located at the north of the school site. There were shared car parking facilities at the front of the building, with access off Church Road.

The proposed extension would measure approximately 6.63m in length and project 3.15m from the existing rear elevation with a roof measuring 3.36m to eaves and 4.6m to ridge. It would be constructed in the same materials and be of the same form as the existing building, with a metal asymmetrical monopitch roof. It was considered to be a modest and proportionate addition which would be in keeping with the character and appearance of the existing development. The rear of the site was visible through the security fencing from the footpath to the north but it would not appear overly prominent in the streetscene and, by virtue of its form, design and materials, would be read as part of the existing building and development at the school.

To the rear of the existing building was a single, mature silver birch tree, the canopy of which would be close to the proposed extension. The applicant's agent had clarified that the tree needed to be removed due to the proximity of the roots and branches to the proposed extension and the potential damage that it would cause to the foundations and the roof. Furthermore, there was a service cable/pipe running underneath the tree, which would have to be

relocated to enable the extension to be built; however this could be compensated through replacement planting and the submission of a planting scheme was, therefore, recommended as a condition.

The Council's Geotechnical Engineer had requested that the applicant submitted a mining report and advised that, if the report identified a shallow mining problem, investigations might be required. Members were advised that following a review of the report, the issues could be dealt with through appropriate mitigation.

One letter of objection had been received, as summarised in the report, regarding the potential for noisy activities within the building. However, there were no existing conditions relating to hours or restricting particular activities on the original 1997 permission for the parish council building. But, as the development would be a sufficient distance from adjoining residential properties, the proposal would not have an unduly harmful impact on their amenities.

In conclusion, it was considered that the proposed extension was acceptable in terms of its scale, design, form and materials, would be in keeping with the character and appearance of the existing development, and would not have an adverse impact on adjoining residential properties or on the streetscene.

Councillor R.E. Groom, the other Ward Member for Wrockwardine Wood & Trench, was invited to address the Board and spoke in support of the application which would provide a much needed storage facility for this community building. His only concern was the loss of the silver birch tree but he said that the Parish Council would guarantee to provide a replacement. Given the concerns expressed at the loss of the tree, it was proposed that the recommendation shown in the officer's report be amended to seek the submission of a planting scheme to include a suitable replacement tree prior to commencement of the development. In addition, as set out in the tabled update sheet, it was proposed that a further condition be added to the approval regarding mitigation and contamination informatives, as requested by the Council's Environmental Engineering Section.

**RESOLVED - that with respect to planning application W2009/0793 delegated authority be granted to the Head of Planning & Transport to grant planning permission subject to the submission of satisfactory additional information that addressed geotechnical issues, a mitigation condition as recommended by the Environmental Engineering Section and contamination informatives, to the conditions as set out in the report, and to the prior submission of a planting scheme to include a suitable replacement tree.**

(Councillor C.F. Smith returned to the meeting).

- (e) W2009/0797 – Public Open Space to the rear of Kesworth Drive, Priorslee, Telford, Shropshire

This application by Telford & Wrekin Council sought planning permission for the refurbishment of the existing children's ball court and seating area and the erection of 3m high mesh fencing on an established games court within an area of recreational land. The refurbishment would include resurfacing of the adjacent footpaths, provision of an additional footpath to service the seating area, and upgraded litter bins and safety signage.

The proposal would provide an upgraded multi-use games area, bounded by 3 metre high gridweld mesh fencing with 0.5 metre high crank top. It would provide facilities for a range of activities such as basketball, cricket and 5-a-side football for use by the community. The layout of the facility would not be changed but its design would be amended to bring it up to modern safety standards and to meet the expectations of the young people who would use the facility.

The addition of fencing would make it a more prominent structure than the existing ball court, but it was considered that the overall scheme was appropriate to the context of the area, both visually and functionally. It was considered that the design was in accordance with local design policies CS15 of the Core Strategy and UD2 of the Local Plan. There would be no adverse impact on the amenities of the area, as the site was located well away from residential properties, with substantial screening around the boundaries of the recreation land.

The site was located in the Green Network and Policy OL4 of the Wrekin Local Plan permitted development provided there were community benefits, such as recreational facilities. This scheme, therefore, met the aims of the Green Network and provided important community facilities for local residents. The Geotechnical Engineer had recommended approval subject to Informatives relating to former mineral workings and contaminated land.

The Chairman commented that this proposal was in his Ward and would provide a much need facility for youngsters of 12-18 years.

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application W2009/0797 planning permission be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

(f) W2009/0805 – Ladygrove Primary School, Old Office Road, Dawley, Telford, Shropshire

This application by Telford & Wrekin Council requested planning permission for the erection of a single storey classroom extension at the end of the north-eastern wing of the school, including installation of a glazed corridor and lobby to the side. The site of the proposed extension was currently a hard play area but planning application W2009/0621 had been previously approved to extend the play area to facilitate this extension.

The extension would be timber framed with facing brickwork to form one classroom and a glazed corridor to be used as a cloak area. It would follow the inner roof pitch, but with a lower roof pitch adjacent to the footpath which,

along with the large glazed feature, would create a subservient design that did not dominate the building or the area. Furthermore, with the use of materials to match that of the existing building, the proposal would not be of detriment to the character and appearance of the building or the surrounding area. As the nearest residential properties were located some 40m away and benefited from substantial screening, it was considered that the proposal would not have any detrimental impact on the amenities of neighbouring properties.

In conclusion the proposed use supported the existing school and, as such, complied with Policies CS10 of the Core Strategy and LR1 of the Wrekin Local Plan and would not have an adverse impact the surrounding environment in accordance with Policies UD2 of the Wrekin Local Plan and CS15 of the Core Strategy.

The Council's Geotechnical Engineers had raised no objections to the proposal subject to the placing of some informatives with regard to caution being undertaken on all excavations and the presences of mine shafts.

**RESOLVED – that with respect to planning application WW2009/0805 planning permission be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.**

(g) W2009/0819 – Traffic Roundabout, Junction of Station Road, Newport, Shropshire

Telford & Wrekin Council had submitted this application for the display of four 'available for sponsorship' advertising signs on the central island of this roundabout on the A518 Newport by-pass. There were some dwellings in the vicinity of the roundabout, but the surrounding area was predominantly rural. A significant feature of the roundabout was the 'sheep and pen' metalwork sculpture on the central island which related to the rural character of the area, and provided visual interest.

The proposed signs were part of current Council policy to promote local businesses and similar sized signs were located on many roundabouts in Borough as part of the Telford & Wrekin Community Sponsorship scheme. It was considered that roundabouts within predominantly urban areas were suitable for such signage and that the addition of advertising in urban locations was more likely to be acceptable from the point of view of visual amenity. However this roundabout was situated in a predominantly rural area surrounded by a verdant landscape. There was little signage in the area except for existing highway signs and it was considered that the proposals would detract from the visual appearance of the existing sculpture on the central island of the roundabout.

**RESOLVED – that with respect to planning application W2009/0819 Advertisement Consent be refused for the following reason:**

- 1. The proposed advertising signage would detract from visual amenity in this predominantly rural area and the signs would harm the existing character and appearance of the central island of the roundabout which featured a sculpture installation. Therefore, the**

**proposals would be contrary to the aims and objectives with regard to amenity contained in Policy S31 of the Wrekin Local Plan 1995-2006**

- (h) W2009/0836 – Moorfield Primary School, Wellington Road, Newport, Shropshire

This was an application by Telford & Wrekin Council for the erection of a single storey front extension to the main school building which, together with internal reconfiguration, would create a new waiting area and school reception/administrative office and enlargement of one of the classrooms to make it compliant with Ofsted regulations. The proposal would also improve existing access arrangements, with ramped level access for disabled people and parents with young children. New windows and level access from classrooms was also proposed.

The development was the second phase of improvements to the school involving various refurbishment works/extensions. Phase one of the project had encompassed internal works to the school building that did not require planning permission and which had been carried out during the school summer holiday.

As Members recalled, a similar scheme for extensions/alterations to the front of the school building had been approved by the Plans Board on 19<sup>th</sup> March 2008 and the current proposal was, effectively, an amendment to this which would create a small 'L' shaped extension projecting 4.6 metres in front of the existing building. The proposed extension would extend approximately 17m along part of the front elevation of the main building, projecting out a maximum of 4.6 metres, and would be constructed over an area of both hard surfacing and soft landscaping. The new windows on the side elevation of the building would face the car parking area to the side and the Newport Girls High School. The proposal represented a relatively minor addition to the school which would not significantly alter its character or appearance as the materials would match those of the existing building. There would be little impact on the street scene or the surrounding area and no detrimental impact on any nearby residential properties. There would only be a small loss of soft landscaping and the development would not encroach on the existing vehicular access and car parking area.

**RESOLVED – that with respect to planning application W2009/0836 planning permission be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.**

- (i) W2009/0614 – Stafford Street Car Park, Newport, Shropshire

This planning application was for the erection and relocation of the public toilets within the Council owned Stafford Street Car Park in Newport. The proposed brick building measured approximately 9.8m by 7m, with a hipped tile roof 6m to the ridge, and comprised male and female toilets, a disabled toilet, a baby change area, and a cleaner and service area.

The site was to be acquired by McCarthy and Stone, the applicant, for the comprehensive development of sheltered housing apartments on the land between Stafford Street and the Car Park. In addition, Newport Town Council wished to provide improved, modern public conveniences in the town. The site was currently occupied by three car parking spaces, which would be relocated within the car park. Adjacent to the site were five sycamore trees and a number of recycling skips.

Various sites in the vicinity had been considered for the relocation of the toilet block with the determining factors being the requirement to provide a safe environment, with passive surveillance, and an obvious visual presence. This was the most appropriate location as it was situated adjacent to the main pedestrian route from the car park to the High Street and would locate the toilets closer to the main shopping area of the town.

The proposed development also provided an opportunity to improve the visual appearance of the area by re-arranging the recycling facility area, and incorporating a new pathway and planting bed. The Council's Trees & Woodland Officer had recommended removal of all the existing trees but the Council's Landscape Architect had considered this would be to great a visual loss and had recommended retention of the largest sycamore tree, which had been agreed. This would be supplemented with new ground-cover planting.

The report set out the concerns raised by Newport Town Council. With regard to their request that the door to the maintenance area be located at the rear of the building rather than through the baby-change area, the West Mercia Police Architectural Liaison Officer had suggested that, for security purposes, the access should remain at the front of the building and the number of entrances minimised. The Town Council had queried the provision of two small windows, as it was considered that they could be prone to vandalism, but they would enable light and ventilation to enter the toilet. In response to the Town Council's request that the building be energy efficient and vandal proof, it had been confirmed that the building would have stainless steel doors, automatic 'turn-on and turn-off' lighting inside, and no external lighting.

It was considered that the design of the building and the proposed facing brickwork and plain clay tiles would reflect and respect other buildings in the surrounding area and enhance its visual appearance and quality with no adverse effect upon the nearby Conservation Area. The three parking spaces that would be lost would be relocated to the ends of the parking bays opposite the building and the Council's Highways Engineer had confirmed that these would not have any impact on the manoeuvring space for refuse vehicles and lorries delivering to the adjoining retail units.

Members welcomed the proposal, which would provide an improved community facility.

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application W2009/0614 planning permission be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

**PB-54      SITE VISITS**

None.

**PB-55      PLANNING APPLICATIONS DETERMINED UNDER  
DELEGATED AUTHORITY**

The Board received for information details of planning applications that had been determined under delegated powers.

The meeting ended at 6.45 p.m.

Chairman: .....

Date: .....