

## **PLANS BOARD**

### **Minutes of a meeting of the Plans Board held on Wednesday, 14 September 2011 at 6.00pm in the Reception Suite, Civic Offices, Telford, Shropshire**

**PRESENT:** Councillors J C Minor (Chairman), N A Dugmore, I T W Fletcher (as substitute for Cllr A A Meredith) K R Guy, A S Jhawar, R T Kiernan, L A Murray (as substitute for S A W Reynolds), B J Thompson (as substitute for Cllr J Loveridge) and C R Turley

**ALSO PRESENT:** Councillor C F Smith (for planning application TWC/2011/0574)

#### **PB-036 MINUTES**

**RESOLVED** – that the minutes of the meeting of the Plans Board held on 24 August 2011 be confirmed and signed by the Chairman

#### **PB-037 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Councillors J Loveridge, A A Meredith and S A W Reynolds

#### **PB-038 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor B J Thompson declared a personal and prejudicial interest in planning applications TWC/2011/0022 and TWC/2011/0094 and indicated that he would leave the room during determination thereof.

Councillor I T W Fletcher declared a personal and prejudicial interest in planning application TWC/2011/0376 and indicated that he would leave the room during determination thereof.

#### **PB-039 DEFERRED/WITHDRAWN APPLICATIONS**

None.

#### **PB-040 SITE VISITS**

**RESOLVED** – that the following Site Visits take place on Wednesday, 5 October 2011:

1. TWC/2011/0574 – 3.30pm – 189 & 191 Trench Road, Trench, Telford, Shropshire, TF2 7DU; and
2. TWC/2011/0376 – 4.00pm – Granville Lodge, Church Street, St Georges, Telford, Shropshire, TF2 9LX.

#### **PB-041 PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR DETERMINATION**

Members had received a schedule of planning applications to be determined by the Board and fully considered each report and the supplementary information tabled at the meeting regarding planning applications TWC/2011/0022 and TWC/2011/0472.

*In accordance with his declaration of interest Councillor B J Thompson left the room during determination of the following application.*

- (a) TWC/2011/0022 Sainsburys, Unit 8, Telford Forge Retail Park, Colliers Way, Old Park, Telford, TF3 4AG

This was a proposal for the variation of condition 13 of planning application W95/0969 and condition 21 of planning application W97/0108 (as amended by W2010/0029) to increase the non-food floorspace at the site from 21,019 square metres to 27,799 square metres. The application had been deferred at Plans Board on 22 June 2011 and the proposals were considered in conjunction with planning application TWC/2011/0094. An update report was tabled at the meeting.

Mr J Tsai, a local resident, spoke against the proposals on the grounds that they were in contravention of planning policy and would adversely impact local residential amenity.

Ms C Morrison, speaking against the application on behalf of Telford Trustees, argued that the proposals were out of centre and, therefore, not in accordance with current planning policy. She emphasised that Telford Trustees had made continued investment in the Primary Shopping Area (PSA) despite the prevailing economic climate which had already forced some key retailers to close, and expressed concern that the proposals would undermine these efforts. She pointed out that there would be a detrimental impact on the PSA, which would include hindering efforts to find a replacement supermarket when Asda vacated the Shopping Centre, because the effect of the proposals would be for Sainsbury's to become the largest supermarket in the area. This could have an adverse impact on employment which would counter-balance the jobs purported to result from the proposals. In summary, she considered that there was no justification for the application when opportunities for development remained in the PSA.

Mr D Lazenby, the Applicant's Agent, spoke in favour of the application which he claimed would result in an enhanced shopping environment, improved access and increased customer choice within an environmentally sustainable site. He pointed to increased employment and design amendments to address landscaping and amenity issues. He considered that the application would allow competition with other businesses at Forge Retail Park selling similar goods and was therefore not in contravention of policy OP5. He referred to recent government guidance and ministerial statements which did not support disaggregation of business and argued that the proposals were, therefore, not in contravention of planning policy. He concluded that the proposals would be beneficial for Telford.

In response, the Planning Officer referred Members to his report which comprehensively addressed issues surrounding planning policy (including PPS4, CTAAP and OP5) and his conclusion that the application failed the Sequential Analysis. He referred to objections received regarding loss of residential amenity and also objections from Morrisons and Telford Trustees, both citing current planning policy, and considered that investor confidence was a material planning consideration in this case.

The Head of Housing and Planning advised Members that this was the first test of an important policy document which had been considered at some length by Officers and an Independent Planning Inspector and he considered that the Authority therefore benefitted from one of the most up-to-date adopted planning policies in the country. He advised that guidance referred to by Mr Lazenby was a Draft Framework for consultation

which had already been subject to considerable opposition. He explained that despite being an extension of the existing Sainsbury's site, the application represented the provision of new floorspace and therefore was subject to the application of current policy.

Some Members expressed support for both applications TWC/2011/0022 and TWC/2011/0094 and made comments which included opinions that the applicants had entered into discussions prior to the introduction of CTAAP and therefore should not be subject to it, that some sites considered as part of the Sequential Analysis were unsuitable and that the application would provide employment opportunities and highways improvements to the area. However, some Members considered that there was sufficient space within the Town Centre which gave opportunities for the applicants to diversify from their current business model and disaggregate food and non-food retail. Having thoroughly considered the reports for planning applications TWC/2011/0022 and TWC/2011/0094 and the update report tabled at the meeting relating to planning application TWC/2011/0022, having heard from Public Speakers and receiving the professional opinions of Officers, for reasons of planning policy and strategy a majority of Members considered that they were not in a position to grant planning permission.

**RESOLVED** that planning application TWC/2011/0022 be refused for the following reasons:-

- 1) **The Local Planning Authority considers that there are sequentially preferable town centre/edge of centre locations which could accommodate the proposed development. Development in this out of centre location would be contrary to the Spatial Development Strategy for the Borough as set out in the Core Strategy and would seriously undermine the Council's efforts to ensure that the town centre remains at the hub of the service centre hierarchy and the Council's objective of regenerating Telford town centre. The proposal conflicts with Policies CS4 of the adopted Core Strategy, CT2 of the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan and EC15 of Planning Policy Statement 4.**
- 2) **The proposal is contrary to Policy OP5 of the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan and to Policy EC16.1 of Planning Policy Statement 4. In the absence of reasoned justification, the proposed development in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority would be likely to have an unacceptable detrimental impact on the vitality, attractiveness and viability of Telford Town Centre and would be likely to establish an undesirable precedent for the further development for retail purposes at out-of-centre locations which would undermine existing and potential investor confidence in Telford Town Centre.**

(b) TWC/2011/0032 Queens Arms, Southall Road, Dawley, Telford, Shropshire, TF4 3LY

This application sought full planning permission for the conversion of the existing vacant Queens Arms Public House to provide 4no. 2 bedroom flats and 1 no. 1 bedroom flat. Councillor F Bould, Borough Ward Councillor, had requested that the application be determined by the Plans Board. This application was considered in conjunction with planning application TWC/2011/0052.

Members expressed some concerns about parking provision but generally welcomed reinvigoration of the site.

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application TWC/2011/0032 the Head of Housing & Planning be authorised to grant planning permission subject to the applicants entering into a Section 106 Agreement relating to the provision of a contribution of £2000 towards double yellow lines in the turning head on Rowan Avenue and further subject to the conditions as set out in the report

- (c) TWC/2011/0052 The Queens Arms, Southall Road, Dawley, Telford TF4 3LY

This application sought full planning permission for the erection of 2No. three bed semi-detached houses and 1No. three bed detached house. Each of the properties would have an integral single garage and parking space, and amenity space to the rear. This application was considered in conjunction with planning application TWC/2011/0032 and the content of the debate is detailed above at minute number PB-041(b).

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application TWC/2011/0032 the Head of Housing & Planning be authorised to grant planning permission subject to the applicants entering into a Section 106 Agreement relating to the provision of a contribution of £2000 towards double yellow lines on Hinkshay Road and further subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

*In accordance with his earlier declaration of interest Councillor B J Thompson remained absent from the room during determination of the following application.*

- (d) TWC/2011/0094 Sainsburys, Unit 8, Telford Forge Retail Park, Colliers Way, Old Park, Telford, Shropshire, TF3 4AG

This proposal was for full planning permission for the erection of a store extension (Class A1) to the side and front of the existing store at the Forge Retail Park together with alterations to car parking layout, new parking deck, landscaping, relocated recycling facilities and associated plant. This application had been deferred at the Board meeting on 22 June 2011 with a requirement that the applicant provided further sequential assessment. The proposals were considered in conjunction with planning application TWC/2011/0022 and the content of the debate is detailed above at minute number PB-041(a).

**RESOLVED** that planning application TWC/2011/0094 be refused for the following reasons:-

- 1) The Local Planning Authority considers that there is a number of sequentially preferable town centre/edge of centre locations which could accommodate the proposed development. Development in this out of centre location would be contrary to the Spatial Development Strategy for the Borough as set out in the Core Strategy and would seriously undermine the Council's efforts to ensure that the town centre remains at the hub of the service centre hierarchy and the Council's objective of regenerating Telford town centre. The proposal conflicts with Policies CS4 of the adopted Core Strategy, CT2 of the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan and EC15 of Planning Policy Statement 4.
- 2) The proposal is contrary to Policy OP5 of the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan and to Policy EC16.1 of Planning Policy Statement 4. In the absence of reasoned justification, the proposed development in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority would be likely to have an unacceptable detrimental impact on the vitality, attractiveness and viability of Telford Town

Centre and would be likely to establish an undesirable precedent for the further development for retail purposes at out-of-centre locations which would undermine existing and potential investor confidence in Telford Town Centre.

- 3) Part of the site is designated as green space as defined in the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan. In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal has failed to recognise the importance of this green space in terms of its function as a landscape and amenity feature and the importance this space provides interlinking to the wider green spaces and green network in the locality. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Policies CT20 and CT21 of the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan and Policy OL3 of the Wrekin Local Plan.
- 4) The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed car parking deck involving the loss of existing landscaping and due to its siting hard up to neighbouring boundaries would result in an overly harsh and incongruous design element in a prominent location when viewed from the approach roads and close to adjoining residential properties causing material harm to the quality of the environment and existing neighbouring uses in the locality, which would be detrimental to visual and residential amenities and thereby contrary to Policies CT10, CT15, CT20 and CT17 of the adopted Central Telford Area Action Plan and Policy UD2 of the Wrekin Local Plan.

- (e) TWC/2011/0472 1-8 Turreff Bungalows, Wrockwardine, Shropshire, TF6 5DF

This application, considered in conjunction with TWC/2011/0473 below, sought consent for the demolition of the existing 8 x 1 bed single storey bungalows, and the erection of 6 x 2-bedroom bungalows with new access road and vehicular parking. The existing units provided social rented accommodation and this proposal would retain this tenure managed through a Registered Social Landlord. An update report was tabled at the meeting.

Mr J Hall, local resident, spoke against the proposals, referring to the bullet points on page 63 of the agenda and highlighting concerns regarding loss of light and roof design, and seeking clarification regarding the type of tile to be used, the presence of asbestos and the loss of mature trees on the site.

Mr T Russell, the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application focussing on design details and Ms R North, for the applicant, spoke regarding housing need in the area.

Although understanding the concerns of local residents, Members were generally supportive of the proposals with some Members commenting upon the success of similar schemes in the Borough. The Planning Officer detailed the Planning Considerations in the report, confirmed that the applicant had been cautioned for felling trees without consent and clarified the number of replacement trees.

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application TWC/2011/0472 the Head of Housing & Planning be authorised to grant planning permission subject to the applicants entering into a Section 106 Agreement relating to the provision of 100% affordable housing and further subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

(f) TWC/2011/0473 1-8 Turreff Bungalows, Wrockwardine, Shropshire, TF6 5DF

This application sought Conservation Area Consent for the demolition of the existing 8 x 1 bed single storey bungalows. This application was considered in conjunction with planning application TWC/2011/0472 and the content of the debate is detailed above at minute number PB-041(e).

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application TWC/2011/0473 conservation area consent be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

(g) TWC/2011/0546 57 Park Street, Madeley, Telford, Shropshire, TF7 5LD

This application sought a minor material amendment to W2009/0385 for the erection of 2no. two bed apartments. Planning permission had been granted in 2009 and the apartments had been built. However the development had not been constructed in accordance with the approved plans. This application had, therefore, been submitted to regularise the situation and Borough Councillor P Watling had requested that this application be determined by Plans Board. Members were reminded that the principle of development had previously been approved, and the scale of the development had not changed, however the main amendment involved the design of the roof.

This application had been deferred at the last Board meeting to enable Members to undertake a site visit. Referring to that site visit, Members considered that the proposals were acceptable.

**RESOLVED** – that with respect to planning application TWC/2011/0546 planning permission be granted subject to the conditions as set out in the report.

The meeting ended at 7.44pm

**Chairman:** .....

**Date:** .....