

TWC/2015/0682

The Old Vicarage, St Lukes Road, Doseley, Telford, Shropshire, TF4 3BD
Erection of single storey rear extension

APPLICANT

Alexander Ragonesi

RECEIVED

27/07/2015

PARISH

Dawley Hamlets

WARD

Horsehay and Lightmoor

OFFICER Kirsty Johnson

CLLR CLIVE MOLLET HAS REQUESTED THE APPLICATION IS CONSIDERED BY MEMBERS OF COMMITTEE

1. PROPOSAL

- 1.1 This application is for full planning consent for the erection of a single storey rear extension at The Old Vicarage, a locally listed building.
- 1.2 The extension will provide additional space to the existing kitchen.
- 1.3 Planning permission is required as the extension is intended to be attached to an existing side extension that links the main dwelling to a two storey annex (previously a detached house) and does not form part of the original house.

2. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 2.1 The application site is located within Doseley which is situated within the west of Telford. Doseley has a mixture of residential and commercial uses. The Old Vicarage is accessed from St Lukes Road which leads to the property as well as two other buildings, one of which is a listed building Saint Lukes House, a converted church.
- 2.2 To the east - out of view from the site – is the Doseley Industrial Estate and to the south is residential development.
- 2.3 The Old Vicarage, a local interest building, is situated at the end of St Luke's Road and sits prominent within its large well established grounds. The Local Interest Building is unique in its design with the principle elevation fronting the "rear" of the property overlooking its grounds.
- 2.4 The design of the building has significant and historical features of steep gable ends with bargeboard detailing. Notably there have been previous extensions to the building including a two storey side extension a single storey extension which linked both The Old Vicarage and the previous Coach House combining both properties into one. Furthermore, within the boundary of the property there has also been additional accommodation in the form of a log cabin.

3. RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

- 3.1 W2007/1005 – Erection of a an extension to link main house and version of room into snooker room with cinema room above and extension to kitchen – Full Granted 07/09/2007
- 3.2 W74/0500 Alterations to existing dwelling house - approve with conditions pre 1989 14/11/1974

4. PLANNING POLICY CONTEXT

- 4.1 National Planning Policy Framework (the NPPF)
- 4.2 Saved Wrekin Local Plan policies
UD2 Design Criteria – General design guidance relating specifically to respecting historic value and maintaining the quality of the skyline.

HE25 Buildings of Local Interest – the Council will resist development which would have an adverse impact on the character, form and fabric of the buildings or would remove or mask major features of interest and cause detrimental impact on the settings of the building or damage floorscape, materials or other features.

- 4.3 LDF Core Strategy policies
CS14 Cultural Historic and Built Environment – Focuses on the protection, conservation and enhancement of the unique character of the World Heritage Site.

CS15 Urban Design – Looks to strengthen local identity and positively influence the appearance and use of the local environment.

5. SUMMARY OF CONSULTATION RESPONSES

- 5.1 Dawley Hamlets Parish Council: No comment
- 5.2 Cllr Clive Mollett: Support - the proposed alterations are not visible from outside the site and the historic property has already been substantially modified.
- 5.3 Built Heritage Conservation: Object - Considers that the proposed development continues the accumulative change which has begun to dilute the value of the local interest building and its character. The design itself is inappropriate – the glazing is excessive and out of proportion with the emphasis being horizontal rather than vertical (reflected throughout the existing house) and the hipped roof with the glazed roof lantern only aggravates its inappropriate form within its context and sits awkwardly against repeated steep gables
- 5.4 Ecology: Comment – recommend informative bats, great crested newts, storage of materials
- 5.5 Shropshire Council: No comment
- 5.6 Shropshire Fire: No comment

- 5.7 Following direct neighbour consultation, one letter has been received from an adjacent resident supporting the application as it is not visible from the highway or adjoining neighbours.

6. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 6.1 Having regard to the development plan policy and other material considerations including comments received during the consultation process, the planning application raises the following main issues:
- The principle of an extension
 - Impact on Local Interest Building
 - Design, scale and mass

Principle of an extension

- 6.2 The National Planning Policy Framework Paragraphs 58, 61 and 64 relate to the requirement for good design promoting innovative and inclusive design which should address the connections between the built and historic environment. This also directs the local planning authority to refuse development of poor design that fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality.

- 6.3 Para 132 - 138 of the NPPF provide policy guidance for conserving and enhancing the historic environment, this makes reference to the significance of setting and heritage assets affected. Heritage assets are defined in the NPPF as:

A building, monument, site, place, area or landscape identified as having a degree of significance meriting consideration in planning decisions, because of its heritage interest. Heritage asset includes designated heritage assets and assets identified by the local planning authority (including local listing).

- 6.4 The Council supports the principle of alterations to properties subject to appropriate design, scale and mass. All proposals are to be assessed on a site by site basis taking into consideration any additional constraints associated with the property. In this instance, the proposed development will be associated with a Local Interest Building; the Council must assess this application against the NPPF and HE25 of the Wrekin Local Plan to determine if the development would have an adverse impact upon the character, form and fabric of the local interest building.

Impact on Local Interest Building

- 6.5 The property is a local interest building set within a historical setting with the grade II listed St Luke's Church to the east. This setting is unique to Doseley as this particular area has few heritage assets, further emphasising the need to protect and preserve such an exceptional setting. Alterations and additions

to local interest buildings will only be permitted where the development would not adversely affect the character, features or setting of the building.

- 6.6 The local interest building has already been heavily extended and altered with a two storey side extension to the east and a single storey link extension that joined the separate coach house building (which itself has been extended to be converted into a snooker room at ground floor and cinema room at first floor). In addition, further accommodation has been acquired within its grounds with log cabins. These extensive alterations and additions have resulted in officers questioning the need for the additional space with the floor area already significantly increased and the harm and dominance this causes to the original building.
- 6.7 The design and access statement submitted with the application dismissed any internal alterations which may provide a more functional layout utilising the existing floor area, the response provided no significant evidence for the increased floor space other than a preference for a larger kitchen linking with the garden.
- 6.8 The building has been protected by this designated status due to its rarity when judged against local characteristics, the age of the asset (Mid-19th Century), and its historical association with the grade II listed Church and its aesthetic value with intrinsic design. This building meets the criteria of Historic England's national guidance to Local Listed Buildings; whereby it is the duty of the Council to protect these significant features of interest and to resist development which may mask this with inappropriate and poor quality additions.
- 6.9 Officers consider that this additional extension would further dilute the importance of this designated heritage asset, as the extensions to the property become more dominant than the original building as it becomes encompassed with new development, and therefore it is considered that the proposed extension would have an adverse impact upon the character of the local interest building.

Design, scale and mass

- 6.10 The Old Vicarage is situated at the end of St Luke's Road and the rear elevation is not visible from the highway. This property is unique with two principal elevations, with the rear elevation - fronting the rear garden - being the dominant principal elevation. Consequently, in determining this application it is not based on visibility or the impact on the 'front' elevation but the focus is on the principal elevation to the rear which is of historical importance.
- 6.11 Officers have considered the design of the extension against UD2 of the Wrekin Local Plan and CS15 of the Core Strategy and conclude the proposed extension is detrimental to the character and merit of the original building; this is due to a disproportionate and dominant extension which does not incorporate the existing features of the property. The Old Vicarage has clear unique features which are the grounds of its designation with steep gables

with decorative bargeboards and drip moulds. The extension would seek to introduce a new roof deviating from the original with a form of mansard roof including a lantern which is off-centre creating a form of development that does not respect nor relate to the original property as well as masking the original side elevation. Additionally insufficient justification has been submitted to the Local Authority to demonstrate that the harm to the local interest building is outweighed by the need for the additional accommodation, which could rationally be provided with the rationalisation of existing floor space.

- 6.12 Furthermore, the design of the property has vertical emphasis with narrow sections incorporating the steep gables projecting towards the ridgeline. The extension will not represent this emphasis providing an elongated elevation. It is recognised that the design is not too dissimilar to the existing link extension; however, this will increase the glazing and will be more prominent within the rear elevation due to the significant projection forward. The rear elevation has a stepped arrangement with the central gable projecting out into the rear garden creating a focal point. The new addition will remove this feature by pushing the current link extension flush with the original elevation.
- 6.13 The important consideration within this application is the extension is not just extending the original property but will further increase an existing 'link' extension. Link extensions should sit subservient and should not be dominant in scale or design. The previous approval W2007/1005 successfully achieved this subservience by setting the extension back from the principle elevation with a simplistic design. The application now wishes to infill this imperative area which serves an important function in breaking up the rear elevation and retaining some degree of separation from the former Coach House.
- 6.14 Prior to the submission of the application advice was given to the applicant/agent raising the above concerns including an on-site meeting. Within the application process, further comments were sent to the applicant/agent requesting amendments to the application to address officers concerns, unfortunately the applicant/agent did not wish to engage with the Local Planning Authority.

Other matters

- 6.15 In considering this application, officers are satisfied that the proposal will not adversely affect the living conditions of neighbouring properties, and that there would be no adverse impact on protected species, or archaeological assets.

7. CONCLUSIONS

- 7.1 In considering this application the two primary factors that weigh in the planning balance are the effect of the proposal on the heritage assets namely the character of a locally listed building when considered against the benefits of additional floor space.

- 7.2 The proposed extension would not respect or relate to the original building with poor and inappropriate design which causes detrimental impact on the fabric of the local interest building. The development would mask major features of interest and would adversely affect the traditional frontage. The local interest building is considered to provide an important asset within the area contributing to local distinctiveness and the Wrekin Local Plan is clear in confirming that development which fails to relate to and preserve the form and character of the building will be rejected.

8. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Planning Committee **Refuse** the application for the following reason: -

1. The Local Authority considers that the proposed development would have an adverse impact upon the character, form and fabric of the Local Interest building contrary to 'Saved' Policy HE25 of the Wrekin Local Plan which seeks to ensure that the buildings of local interest are preserved or enhanced. Furthermore no justification has been provided to demonstrate that the harm caused by the proposed extension is outweighed by the need for the additional accommodation. The Local Planning Authority therefore considers that the proposal is contrary to policy HE25, UD2 of the Wrekin Local Plan, CS14 and CS15 of the Core Strategy and guidance contained within the NPPF.