

TWC/2014/1093

Site of Lyndale, Middle Lane, Cold Hatton Heath, Telford, Shropshire
Demolition of existing dwelling and outbuildings and erection of a 4 bedroomed dwelling with double garage and creation of access

APPLICANT

Mark Pound

RECEIVED

09/12/2014

PARISH

Waters Upton

WARD

Ercall Magna, Edgmond and Ercall
Magna

OFFICER Kirsty Johnson

OBJECTIONS: YES

CLLR STEPHEN BENTLEY HAS REQUESTED THAT THIS APPLICATION BE DETERMINED BY PLANNING COMMITTEE

MAIN ISSUES

Replacement dwelling in the rural area; scale, mass and design.

PROPOSAL

This full planning application seeks consent for the erection of a detached, two storeys, and four bedrooms dwelling following the demolition of the existing three bedroom bungalow, garage and various outbuildings. The proposed dwelling will be sited in approximately the same location as the existing bungalow.

The dwelling is intended to be built with a gable roof with two gable ends on the front elevation. The new dwelling will be built beneath a gabled roof with chimneys projecting from the ridgeline. On the principal elevation the elevation will have glazed central panels from floor to roof level with brick detailing between each floor. The windows detailing include brick arched headers and cills. To the rear of the property a large wing extension will project from the rear to provide a lounge area. The height of the dwelling is 8.4m from floor to ridge height, and the height of the gables will be 7m. The width of the frontage of the dwelling is 14m with the width of each gable at 4.5m. The height to the eaves of the dwelling is 4.4m. The garage will have an overall height of 4.3m with a width of 6.2m and a depth of 5.1m.

Access to the site has already been established and a large gravel driveway will be laid to provide on-site parking for several vehicles, with a single storey double garage to the front of property.

SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

The application site lies off Middle Lane, accessed from the A442, in the rural village of Cold Hatton and is a sizeable relatively level plot. Cold Hatton is located approximately 8 miles north of Wellington and 10 miles north of Telford. The site in its present form consists of a single storey dwelling with an attached garage built during the 1940s which is set back from the roadway and a number of outbuildings to the rear of the dwelling, all of which are in poor condition. In addition there is a

caravan on the site to the west of the dwelling. The height of the original dwelling is 5.5m with the width of the house without the attached garage being 12m, with garage is 15m. The height to the eaves of the property is 2.5m.

Immediately to both sides and to the rear of the plot is open countryside however there are nearby neighbouring dwellings which are a mix of age, style and design including single storey and two storey buildings. Existing boundary treatments are a combination of hedging, dwarf walls and agricultural fencing. A large Silver Birch tree stands directly in front of the attached garage however this will need to be removed as part of the proposed development of the site.

SUMMARISED CONSULTATIONS

Standard consultation responses

Waters Upton Parish Council: No comments have been received.

Highways: No Objection

The Highways Officer has requested a condition for the driveway to be surfaced in bound material for a minimum distance of 5m from the rear of the highway carriageway.

Drainage: Support subject to conditions

Drainage have requested conditions relating to foul drainage and surface water drainage as well as proposed soak away.

Ecology: Comment

Condition nest boxes/wildlife informative/ Lighting Plan Informatives: Bats, Nesting Wild Birds, Trenches and Pipework

Shropshire Fire Service: Comment

Shropshire Fire Authority has requested a standard informative.

Neighbour consultation responses

A single letter of objection was received following neighbour consultation:

- The current building contains asbestos
- The application fails to consider the area of the site with regards to drainage.
- The redline does not correspond with the previous planning application.
- The footprint of the dwelling is significantly larger than originally approved.
- The development would not have enough parking and would cause issues with the highway.
- The pitch of the roof is considered too high and could lead to a conversion.
- The previous application requested east facing windows to be obscure glass, this should be retained.

- The close proximity of the chimney raising concerns with Environmental health and pollution.

RELEVANT HISTORY

TWC/2013/0273, Demolition of existing single storey dwelling and outbuildings and erection of a detached two storey dwelling, Full Granted 23/09/2013

RELEVANT POLICIES

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

Core Strategy:

CS1 Homes

CS7 Rural Area

CS15 Urban Design

Wrekin Local Plan:

UD2 Design Criteria

PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

Principle of Development

The principle of a replacement dwelling has been established on this site through approval of TWC/2013/0273. Key to this, Policy CS7 of the Core Strategy states that development within the rural area will be focussed on the settlements of High Ercall, Tibberton and Waters Upton. Cold Hatton falls outside of these named settlements however the proposed scheme is for a replacement dwelling within the rural area and not the development of an additional dwelling. The National Planning Policy Framework has a presumption in favour of sustainable development and where development is allowed to achieve good levels of design, adding to the overall quality of an area, responding to local character and to provide dwellings that are visually attractive as a result of good architecture and appropriate landscaping.

Fundamental to consideration of this application is therefore the design of the scheme, including that in terms of a replacement dwelling, the proposed dwelling is not disproportionate in size in relation to the existing dwelling and subject to an appropriate choice of materials.

The Wrekin Local Plan, Policy UD2 Design Criteria, requires new development to be of high quality and distinctive design, whilst also respecting and relating to the context, both visually and functionally and enhancing the quality of the local environment. This policy advises the Council to assess the development in relation to its scale, massing, form, density, orientation, layout, proportions, materials, landscape elements, access and spatial quality.

In addition to this policy, the Core Strategy, CS15 Urban Design, states the design of development will assist in creating and sustaining safe places, strengthening local identity and projecting a positive local image, positively influencing the appearance and use of the local environment.

Character Assessment

Cold Hatton is characterised by three lanes Shop Lane, Middle Lane and Stars Lane where the dwellings are sporadically set within these primary lanes. Properties within Cold Hatton are mainly road fronting with some properties set back from the highway. There is a mix of commercial and agricultural within the area with Nurseries to the east of the site and small holdings in close proximity. Cold Hatton is split by the A442 further emphasising the sporadic nature of the area.

There are a variety of architectural characters within Cold Hatton, however the most repetitive features come from Duke of Sutherland style properties, with relatively low eave heights, dormer windows and low ridge heights. It is also recognised that the area does host some 1960 and 1940's properties within the area but these properties do contain some character. Cold Hatton is considered to have aesthetic features that clearly identify the character of the area with emphasis within the roof line; dormers, gable ends, chimneys and varying roof heights. Lyndale, itself is a small bungalow but does contain some characteristic typical of the area including chimney features and gable ends.

Development within the rural area and in particular for a replacement dwelling is expected to provide high quality and distinctive design that reflects the character of the area to ensure any development integrates with the wider setting. As the development is for a replacement dwelling, the design of the replacement is expected to be a betterment that will contribute positively to the rural area and its setting.

Design, Mass and Scale

The application has been subject to many amendments as part of the application process with three amendments to the original submitted scheme, and various discussions have been had with regards to the design and scale for the development including a site meeting with the applicant, agent, and ward member. The design of the dwelling originally submitted was considered to be out of character as it failed to respect or respond positively to the context of the area, both visually and functionally; furthermore, it did not enhance the quality of the local environment with poor inappropriate design. The design detail of the dwelling was considered to relate more-so to a dwelling that would be expected within the urban area and lacked rural character.

The proposal as amended has introduced a chimney, and removed some dormer elements. The Local Planning Authority acknowledges that attempts have been made to add some architectural details that are featured in the locality such as eaves detailing and brick arches above windows. However, when reading the dwelling as a whole there are fundamental flaws in its design, particularly with the scale, mass, design and proportions of the dwelling as well as the position of the detached garage that has been set in such a position that it significantly detracts from the context from the principal elevation and has removed the view of the majority of one of the two gables, and is of oversized nature. The amendments to the application are not considered to address the local planning authorities main concerns of design, scale and lack of rural character and as such the building would cause significant harm to the setting of the rural area when read immediately adjacent to a single storey bungalow and wider setting when read from the A442, and the approach onto Middle

Lane, and as such and would cause detrimental impact to the landscape character within the countryside.

The scale and design of the dwelling are essential within this application due to the dwellings exposed setting to the open nature of the site with open countryside, as well as the exposure to the property to the eastern boundary, a detached modest bungalow.

The design of the dwelling has significant issues with regards to the proportions and in particular with regards to the brick to void ratio. The front of the proposed dwelling has a glazed section located between the two gables with two small windows either side, the frontage is considered to be too wide creating horizontal emphasis along the frontage this combined with the design of the central glazed area is considerable out of character for the area.

The roof of the dwelling is dominant; within Cold Hatton the ridge height of the roof of dwellings is the same height as gable end projections, and the ratio of roof to frontage is generally the roof at one third and the frontage being more prominent with two thirds. The proposed dwelling is considered to be unbalanced creating a top heavy dwelling, which exasperates the other crucial issue with regards to the scale of the property. Officers considered a similar footprint and space could be achieved by dividing the bulk of the roof forming a smaller central gable and the introduction of gables to the rear, reducing the overall height to an acceptable height. The applicant however is unwilling to amend this application further.

The current site accommodates a modest bungalow within a sizeable plot, although a previous consent has been granted on this site, however the proposal is larger than the previously approved application within an increased floor area of 56m² and the height has increased in replacement of the existing bungalow at 5.5m. Furthermore the overall design of the dwelling exasperates the mass of the dwelling. In addition this application has lost significant features that are typical within the locality that were successfully represented within the previously application TWC/2013/0273.

Highways, Drainage and Ecology

No objections have been received from the local highway authority, they consider the application can be accessed and has requested standard conditions with regards to surfacing. Drainage has supported the application subject to details of foul drainage and surface water drainage as well as proposed soak away. Ecology have also raised no objection to the development requesting that conditions are applied to the application with regards to nest boxes, wildlife, lighting plan and informatives for nesting wild birds, bats, trenches and pipework.

Other considerations:

The local residents have raised concerns with the development, with regards to the scale of the development and height of the roof and issues of overlooking. Furthermore, they have raised concerns with asbestos; this is not a planning matter and is covered under separate health and safety legislation with regards to the handling and disposal of asbestos.

Conclusion and Recommendations

As previously referenced in this report, the principle of a replacement dwelling of a two storey nature has been established through the previous approval TWC/2013/0273 and this original application is considered to be a characterful and a positive addition to the area. This proposal however fails to take account of the immediate and wider setting, by virtue of the design, form and scale which are considered to be detrimental to the character of Cold Hatton, furthermore the proposal has failed to incorporate key features of the area and the architectural design has not considered the sensitive location with an incongruous design. The inappropriate design does not respect or relate to any adjacent building or features of the rural village. The development is therefore considered to cause significant harm to the rural area as the design of the dwelling does not respect or integrate with the wider landscape setting, contrary to UD2, of the Wrekin Local Plan, CS15 of the Core Strategy and guidance contained within the NPPF.

RECOMMENDATION: Full Refused

Reason for Refusal

1. The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposed replacement dwelling, by virtue of its scale, mass and design fails to respect and reinforce the character of the surrounding area, and would not represent an enhancement from the existing property in this setting and therefore would not contribute to the character of this part of the rural area of the Borough. This would introduce an element which is unsympathetic and alien to the design of the streetscene and would appear incongruous, detracting from the character and appearance of the area. Accordingly the proposal would fail to comply with National planning guidance contained within the NPPF, and local policies CS15 or the Core Strategy, and UD2 of the Wrekin Local Plan.